

## Comparative Examination of Female Representation in English Textbooks of Azad Jammu and Kashmir and Punjab Textbook Boards for Secondary Level

Shiza Javed<sup>1</sup>  
Fauzia Janjua<sup>2</sup>

### Abstract

*Textbooks have been considered an essential element of the National Curriculum and are important in embedding and constructing ideologies through the use of language. The National Curriculum for English Language (NCEL, 2006) has outlined certain standards for the development of textbooks, of which gender is one bench mark embedded in “values and attributes” and “diversity and equality”. Our textbooks generally represent women in their contents but many of the studies (Masud, 2017; Ullah & Haque, 2016; Bloomberg, 2015; Jabeen, Chaudhary & Omer, 2014; Ullah, Ali & Naz, 2014; Hussain, Naseer & Asfar, 2010; Hussain & Asfar, 2009; Durrani, 2008; Mirza, 2004; Mattu & Hussain, 2003) show that the representation is quantitative in nature. The quality of that representation is stereotypical. In contrast to this stereotyping, the present study intends to compare secondary level English textbooks of two textbook boards, Punjab and Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) which are developed following the standards of the National curriculum because apparently, the contents of Azad Jammu and Kashmir Textbook Board (AJKTB) reflect a fairly high amount of contents on women in comparison with Punjab Textbook Board (PTB). The comparison has been drawn on the representation of female characters in the textbook contents by using Fairclough’s “Three Dimensional Model” for discourse analysis. The study found out that woman representation in AJK textbooks is not only quantified but the quality of the contents is also trying to break the stereotypical positioning of women in the society. Whereas, the female characters in the textbooks of PTB are either not representing women or the representation is in quantitative form which is based on the stereotypical form of symbolization. Therefore, the study calls for the revision of the contents of PTB following the benchmarks of “values and attributes” and “diversity and equality” in their true spirit.*

---

<sup>1</sup> MS Scholar, Department of English, IIU, Islamabad

<sup>2</sup> Associate Professor, Department of English, IIU, Islamabad

**Keywords:** Female representation, Textbooks, AJKTB, PTB, Stereotypes, NCEL, values and attributes, diversity and equality

## 1. Introduction

Language plays a vital role in transmitting cultural norms to the new generation. Home, school, and media are some of major institutions to insert these societal norms (Ullah et al., 2014). Among these institutions, the schools take the textbooks as a teaching aid in the classroom, and it is also a fact that textbooks have been written based on the examples from everyday social life, with both male and female genders performing their roles. So, textbooks become a tool of embedding social ideologies in the young's minds (Rafiq & Kanwal, 2016). This is why textbooks have been given a lot of importance in the education system of a country. The textbooks are based on the National Education Policies (NEPs) and National Curriculum Framework (NCF), which have been developed keeping in view the societal and cultural background and needs of a country and also include certain standards that only fit in that particular society. These norms have been incorporated in the textbooks so that the students may know about the social structures through the mirror of the textbooks. This reflection of the society also includes the male and female positioning. A look into the studies on the textbook evaluation in Pakistan (Masud, 2017; Ullah & Haque, 2016; Bloomberg, 2015; Jabeen, Chaudhary, & Omer., 2014; Ullah, Ali, & Naz, 2014; Hussain, Naseer, & Asfar, 2010; Hussain & Asfar, 2009; Durrani, 2008; Mirza, 2004; Mattu & Hussain, 2003), does not give satisfactory results as the gender representation shows consistent stereotypes with the women as mothers, daughters and wives fulfilling their domestic roles without any awareness of their rights. This is alarming as the textbooks reproduce the same content every year. This opposes the standards of National Curriculum Frameworks (NCFs) which allow gender equality and female participation in all the fields. For example, the National Curriculum for English Language (NCEL, 2006) has been developed incorporating the benchmarks as "values and attributes" and "diversity and equality", which aim to represent the "space for an individual in Pakistani society". There is no discrimination on the basis of sex and these values have been embedded in the textbooks merging the societal standards for both males and females. AJKTB has just been established in 2013 and is producing the textbooks which in a formal reading give a positive preview of female characters, in contrast to PTB where the females seem non-existent. In this background, the present study aims to explore the English textbooks of Azad Jammu and Kashmir Textbook Board (AJKTB) and Punjab Textbook Board (PTB) and also aims to compare them as the

textbooks of these textbook boards have been developed following the NCEL (2006), but a preliminary reading shows more space to women in AJKTb than PTB. The female representation in these textbooks has been explored in terms of “values and attributes” and “diversity and equality”.

### **1.1 Research Objectives**

- To explore and compare the kind of female representation in English textbooks of AJKTb and PTB for secondary level with reference to the benchmarks of NCEL (2006) as “values and attributes” and “diversity and equality”.

### **1.2 Research Questions**

- How are the female characters represented in English textbooks of AJKTb and PTB for secondary level in terms of “values and attributes” and “diversity and equality”?

### **1.3 Problem Statement**

Textbooks are ideologically written and they represent the sociocultural and political aspects of a society. The conception of gender roles also gets perpetuated through textbooks, which in Pakistani context particularly shows the repetition of gender stereotypes (Masud, 2017; Ullah & Haque, 2016; Jabeen et al., 2014; Durrani, 2008; Mirza, 2004; Mattu & Hussain, 2003). In contrast to these studies, the preliminary reading of AJKTb and PTB shows no such stereotyping. However, the women representation in the two textbook boards vary in terms of space given to females, where there seems more space to female characters in AJKTb which seems non-existent in PTB textbooks. This difference is alarming and necessary to be investigated as both textbooks boards follow the same curriculum, NCEL (2006). NCEL (2006) asserts the competency of “values of multicultural civilised Pakistani society”, which aims to embed the sociocultural norms such as “values and attributes” and “diversity and equality” (NCEL, 2006, p.119) in the contents of the textbook, which have been used to explore the female representation in English textbooks of AJKTb and PTB.

### **1.4 Significance of the Study**

This study is an addition to the textbook evaluation in Pakistani context with the investigation of values and diversity for females in contrast to the researches which only show gender stereotypes in the textbooks. The comparison of textbook boards is also important as they both follow the

standards of same framework on writing the textbooks. This research also has its importance for future researchers who can expand the sample size.

## 2. Literature Review

### 2.1 Importance of Textbooks in Pakistani Context

Textbooks are considered an important element in Pakistani education system because of a number of reasons such as the place of textbooks as the central resource of learning (Blumberg, 2009; Sadker et al., 2007), the most constant and the essential material (Shaw, 2012), and the only accessible material because of the absence of other aids at secondary level (Mahmood, 2010).

Textbooks are also important because of having effects over the young learners (Shah & Pathan, 2016) and creating gender identities as males and females (Rafiq & Kanwal, 2016; Islam & Asadullah, 2018; Jabeen et al., 2014; Ullah et al., 2014; Jabeen & Ilyas, 2012). Through the characters in the textbooks, a learner's mind gets affected (Ullah et al., 2014).

Textbooks are also important because of transmitting cultural values (Razmjoo & Jozaghi, 2010) and are given a lot of importance in education system.

### 2.2 Representation of Gender in the Textbooks in Pakistan

The over view of researches in Pakistan shows the gender stereotypes in Pakistani textbooks (Masud, 2017; Ullah & Haque, 2016; Bloomberg, 2015; Jabeen et al., 2014; Ullah et al., 2014; Hussain, Naseer, & Asfar, 2010; Hussain & Asfar, 2009; Durrani, 2008; Mirza, 2004; Mattu & Hussain, 2003). These stereotypes follow two ways; firstly the content demeans the female characters, which means the lower ratio of women representation in the textbooks and secondly, the language in the textbooks puts them down. The ratio of women representation in the previous researches can be seen in the following table.

**Table 2.1: An Overview of the Ratio of Female Representation in the Textbooks**

Authors	Year of research	Number of textbooks	Textbooks from	Ratio of female characters
Mirza	2004	194	Provinces of Pakistan	23%

Ullah and Skelton	2013	24	Kheber Pakhtun Khawa Textbook board (KPKTB)	Mentions underrepresentation
Islam Asadullah	2016	4	Malaysia, Indonesia, Pakistan and Bangladesh	47%, 45%, 18% and 40% respectively
Islam Asadullah	2018		Indonesia, Pakistan and Bangladesh	24% in Pakistan
Jabeen and Ilyas	2012	5	Sindh Textbook Board	11.4%
Khurshid, Gillani and Hashmi	2010	4		31% in Urdu 38% in English
Jabeen, et al.	2014	5	Punjab	32% in Urdu 36% in English

The findings in Table 2.1 show the underrepresentation of females in the textbooks in Pakistan which may create a sense of inferiority among the female students reading these textbooks as the textbooks have been equally taught to both male and female students (Hamid & Iqbal, 2013).

The textbooks also represent the stereotypes, by means of two different types of language structures for males and females as is seen in table 2.2.

**Table 2.2: The Verbal Representation of Females in the Textbooks**

Author	Year	Books from	The kind of language	
			For Males	For Females
Hameed	2012	Oxford University Press (OUP) and PTB	“strong, harsh, active and decisive” (p. 139)	“gentle-beings, sweet, silly, coward, charming” (p. 139).
Jabeen and Ilyas	2012	Sindh	“Dad goes out for work every day”	‘caring’ and ‘happy’, “Mom cooks our meals”. “There is no High School for girls in our village” (p. 86). “Mother to Nazia: Child! Go and put the beddings in the sun quickly” (p.27)
Agha, Syed and Mirani	2018	Sindh		“Shabnam and Noori never sit idle. They are always engaged in... stitching, sewing, gardening... washing dishes and cleaning the house. They...keep

				their house neat... and (clean) their class with the help of other girls.” (p. 21)
Ullah, Abdullah, Ahmad and Ali	2018	AJK		“Sadia prepared biryani in 54 minutes and 204aleem in 1/10 hours. How much total time was taken to prepare two dishes”? (p. 8) “Aiman purchased 5m of cloth to make cushion cover. 3.75m of the cloth was used to make all the covers. How much cloth was left”? (p. 9)
Hussain, et al.	2010		the doers, strong and bold	dependent, beautiful, calm and often silly

### 2.3 Reasons of the Repetition of Gender Stereotypes in the Textbooks

The researchers have also explored the reasons behind women representation as; the view of people who do not see the problem with the female representation, and consider women representation in the textbooks as moral evil and the researches on women representation as the wastage of time (Ullah & Ali, 2012). The division of Pakistan is in four provinces and some territories such as AJK and FATA while curriculum is designed by one board that also ignores the issue of gender representation in the textbooks (Blumberg, 2015). Curriculums designers are also the reason of the repetition of gender stereotypes as these members do not change the content of the textbooks assuming on their own that everything is alright (Blumberg, 2015).

### 2.4 Textbook Evaluation Criteria

There are a number of methods to evaluate the textbooks, including textbook evaluation criteria listing (Khurshid et al., 2010; Jabeen et al., 2014), Transitivity Analysis, Kriss and Liwean’s Model of analysing the textbooks (Akincioglu, 2012; Heidari, 2012), and CDA (Shahrokhi, 2015; Yaqoob, 2011). CDA is important in depicting the textbooks as it aims to represent the use of language in social context and highlights “the relations between discourse, power, dominance, social inequality” (Vandijk, 1993, p. 249). Vandijk’s (1991) focus is on the cognition mediating between the text and society, Wodak (2002) considers historical context important in unveiling the relationship of language and society, while Fairclough’s (1989) focus is on language and he puts an emphasis on “textually-oriented analysis” (Fairclough, 2003, p. 2). This model has been used in this study

because of its emphasis on explaining the broader social structures through the close evaluation of the text.

#### 4. Methodology

This study is both qualitative and quantitative in nature. The sample consists of secondary level English Textbooks of AJKTB and PTB. For the analysis of these textbooks, Fairclough's Three Dimensional Model has been used. The analysis follows the sequence of the components given in Table 3.1.

**Table 3.1: Textual Analysis**

Description		
Vocabulary	Grammar	Textual Structures
Overwording	Mood	Interruption
Rewording	• Declarative	Enforcing
Euphemism	• Interrogative	explicitness
Metaphor	• Imperative	Controlling topic
	Modality	Formulation

#### 4. Analysis

##### 4.1. Vocabulary: Overwording

The repetition of words, phrases and sentences or the use of synonyms to show one concept and the use of identical phrases on similar ideas to emphasize on the meaning is called overwording. Table 4.1 demonstrates the comparative view of the use of overwording in AJKTB and PTB English textbooks for secondary level.

**Table 4.1: Overwording**

Overwording in AJKTB textbooks	Frequency	Overwording in AJKTB textbooks	Frequency
1. Business	2	1. I continued work on	2
2. Trade	3	2. Feel	3
3. Helped	2	3. See	9
4. Little	6		
5. Mothers	8		
6. Pray	3		
<b>Synonyms</b>		<b>Synonyms</b>	
7. Business, Profit, Trade caravans (English IX, AJKTB, p. 2)		4. Thrilled, Glad, Happy (English IX, PTB, pp. 94-95).	
8. Weeping, Sobbing, Crying (English IX, AJKTB, p. 34)		5. Behold, See, Observed (English IX, PTB, p. 125).	

9. Replied, Say, Narrates, Said  
(English X, AJKTB, p. 3)

10. Shoulder to shoulder, Equality,  
Equal, Every Muslim (English X,  
AJKTB, p. 26).

---

**Similar words and phrases**

11. Wealthy, Wealth, Helped (with  
profit from the business) (English  
IX, AJKTB, p. 2)

12. "Islam grants women **the right  
of ownership**"

"They can have their **own  
property**"

13. "The right of women to seek  
knowledge is not different from that  
of men".

"Seeking knowledge is mandatory  
for every Muslim".

"They (the women) have got access  
to every educational institution they  
want to join" (English X, AJKTB, p.  
26).

---

**Similar words and phrases**

6. "She rendered useful services in this  
regard".

"She prepared food for this journey".

"This grand task was nicely undertaken by  
Hazrat Asma R.A.".

"She took care of minute details for  
accomplishing the task" (English IX, PTB, p.  
33)

7. "What are you doing? Fighting a lost  
battle?"

"If you spend most of your duty hours on one  
patient, we will have to recruit more nurses to  
attend to other patients",

"Please go and see others patients".

"We don't have much hope for her".

"I don't think that she can ever walk again".

"Senior nurse looked at me with utter surprise  
and remarked that she had orders from the  
doctor in-charge to shift her to the general  
ward".

"The doctors thought that she was a hopeless  
case" (English IX, PTB, pp. 94-95).

---

#### 4.1.1 Interpretation and Explanation

The first two examples in AJKTB textbooks give a high-quality women representation which is absent not only in other researches but in society also with only 1 percent (World Bank Report, 2017) and 0.20 (Hyder, 2018) female entrepreneurship. The repetition of the words puts an emphasis on the business domain for women, a right which is also appreciated in article 18 of the Constitution of Pakistan (1973) but is neglected by the society. This is because in Pakistan, the men are considered the bread earners, so women get fewer chances to go outside and work (Abbas, Abrar, Saleem, & Iqbal, 2016).

The third example in AJKTB accentuates on the role of a helper with the use of wealth through the repetition of word "helper". This role highlights the use of wealth by women, which also lies in contrast to the previous researches where women have not been given the right to use



property (Wattoo, 2014; Ullah and Skelton, 2013; Food and Agriculture Organization United Nations, 2010).

The textbook of AJKTb also allow the equality right for women. It is clearly mentioned in different phrases in the textbook and also in the Constitution of Pakistan 1973, under Article 25. However, the analysis of societal structures shows that women do not have the equality rights in Pakistan (Lund, 2019; Pakistan Today Report, 2017; World Economic Forum, 2016; Bhattacharya, 2014; Chaudhary, Nosheen & Lodi, 2012).

The AJKTb also represents the right of women to get education with reference to Islam. Education for All (EFA), Dakar Framework for Action and the formation of NEPs is also a step from the government of Pakistan to promote education.

The traditional illustration in AJKTb textbooks is the title of “little”, which shows the stereotypes in representing the girls (Jabeen et al., 2014). The adjective “little” has been emphasised with the use of synonyms “weep”, “cry” and “sob”. Another aspect of traditional illustration is the role of mother, also called an unnamed female participant in previous researches (Aoumeur, 2014).

Overwording in the IX class textbook of PTB shows the efforts of a nurse for a patient. The text also highlights a number of dispiriting remarks by senior nurse and doctors who discourage her to help that patient. They want the nurse to work on the patients who have more chances of survival. The rewording highlights her emotional nature but also shows the devotion towards her profession and duty.

The IX class textbook of PTB also highlights the importance of seeing and feelings reflecting the emotional nature of females.

The use of identical phrases in PTB Textbook shows the services of Hazrat Asma R.A. for Islam. However, the authors have emphasized more on the journey than the efforts or services. The use of plural form “services” refers to the activity of “**t(ying) the food** on the camel back” and taking it to the mountain.

#### **4. 2. Vocabulary: Rewording**

Rewording refers to the use of two oppositional stances within a text. It shows the author’s viewpoint over one particular aspect. The use of

rewording in AJKTB has been seen in Table 4.2. The PTB textbook does not contain any illustration of the use of rewording in the text.

**Table 4.2: Rewording in AJKTB**

View 1	View 2
1. "He (Quaid-E-Azam) considered the role of women in the development of society as important as that of men" "He (Quaid-E-Azam) believed women's participation in politics and social welfare work as necessary for the betterment of community" "He (Quaid-E-Azam) wished that women should stand shoulder to shoulder with men"	"But at the same time believed that they should take interest in household work and in social welfare work" (English IX, AJKTB, p. 14).
2. "Hazrat Khadija R.A. was very pious, modest and noble lady. Because of her piety, the people of Makkah Called her Tahira	As she was very wealthy, a lot of Arab nobles wanted to marry her (English IX, AJKTB, p. 2)
3. Equal rights	Hostile attitude (English X, AJKTB, p. 26).

#### 4.2.1 Interpretation and Explanation

The first example of rewording in Table 5 suggests and supports two different statuses for women; the home and the profession. In order to emphasize on the fact that women in Pakistan have to take both domains simultaneously and their professions do not give them an exception of household duties, the author has used Quaid-E-Azam's (the founder of Pakistan) view.

The second example of rewording in the IX class textbook of AJKTB gives two different attributes of women; the piety and the wealth. The reading of the text shows that a woman is preferred to marry because of her wealth while the purity and chastity have been ignored in the society.

The third example of rewording demonstrates that women have been given two varied statuses; equality and marginalization. The former is mentioned in the textbook with reference to Islam while the later with reference to society. According to the author, Islam emphasizes on equal rights of women, but the society has a hostile attitude regarding female rights. It is accentuated as "they (the women in rural areas) work in the field with their male members from dawn to dusk", yet their utility is "to be house

wives". The author clearly negates and opposes the societal attitude, regarding it responsible for "depression and sense of helplessness and deprivation" among women. According to him, "this policy (of marginalizing women) kept the doors of progress closed for women" (English X, AJKTB, p. 26)

#### **4. 3. Euphemism**

Euphemism has been used in the IX class textbook of PTB. The author gives a description of Hazrat Asma R.A.'s services for Islam. In highlighting her valour and courage, the authors try to generalize a concept that it is difficult for women to go outside at night or women cannot go outside at night, through the words, "how difficult it must have been for her to travel to rocky path at night with the constant fear of being detected" (English IX, PTB, p. 33).

#### **4. 4. Metaphor**

The metaphor has been seen only in the X class textbook of AJKTB. The author has quoted Napoleon as; "Give me good mothers; I will give you a great nation" (English X, AJKTB, p. 26). It is a metaphorical description highlighting the importance of women in the role of a mother whose responsibility is to bring up her children for the sake of national progress. However, the author does not favour this view and appreciates the direct involvement of women in national progress.

#### **4.5. Grammar**

##### **4.5.1. Moods of sentences**

##### **4.5.1.1. Declaratives (Giving Information)**

Declarative mood is the most frequent type of sentences. The declarative sentences in the IX class textbook of AJKTB give the reflection of the life of Hazrat Khadija R.A., a Muslim female from Islamic History. According to Jabeen et al. (2014), usually the male get the heroic representation from Islamic history and women have a few appearances in the textbooks. The author in the IX class textbook of AJKTB shows both the personal and professional aspects of the life of Hazrat Khadija R.A., presenting her as an ideal character for the readers, as a successful business lady. She also possesses money, has a share in inheritance and enjoys the right of using her wealth independently. The use of declarative sentences in the IX class textbook of AJKTB also put emphasis on the view that a woman can have all the rights and professions but she needs to fulfill her domestic duties side by side with her profession. The declarative sentences also show a woman in the role of a mother who teaches her son on her own at home and he becomes a successful scientist.

The declarative sentences in the X class textbook of AJKTB represent Hazrat Ayesha R.A. as a narrator, Hinda as a cruel disbeliever, Begum Ra'ana Liaquat Ali as a fighter of women's rights, a teacher, a professor, a delegate and an ambassador. Mrs. Saleem, Ayesha, Hazrat Um-e-Kulsum are the female characters whose roles have been described in declarative sentences as a mother teaching manners, a daughter, and a woman in position of the first lady respectively. Seher, Salma and Nabeela are given their own voice using the first person singular pronoun "I". These girls are the students with high ambitions for future and reflect the participation of girls in education and the professional life.

The IX class textbook of PTB gives a description of the services of Hazrat Asma R.A. for Islam. The author highlights the attributes of courage, generosity and wisdom of Hazrat Asma. He also points towards the stereotypical duty of cooking the food. Miss Ayesha's character gives the interpretation of the women's involvement in the teaching profession. Rahila's character opens the dimension of the nursing profession for the women and Helen Keller's character does not highlight any particular aspect of women representation in the text, but the importance of feelings and sight.

The X class textbook of PTB gives a negative female portrayal in the textbooks. The women have been mentioned only in seven sentences. The first four depict a woman as a thief and the other three as a very strict sister.

#### 4.5.1.2. Interrogatives

Interrogative is the second most frequent kind of sentences in English textbooks of AJKTB and PTB for secondary level.

**Table 4.3: Interrogatives**

Interrogative	Interpretation and Explanation
"Are you trying to drown me, Father?" (English IX, AJKTB, p. 35).	This is a question of a daughter to her father. The relationship or the conversation does not highlight any aspect of power-relation between the participants. It is an informal question.
1. "Would you please tell us how drug addicts take drugs?" 2. "Salma, can you tell us something about	The first is a question of a female student to her teacher. The second question is asked by the teacher from the student during a lecture in the class. These examples do not emphasize on women representation but teacher-student relationship. However, the presence of students allows the

dental health"? (English X, AJKTB, p. 133).	interpretation of female participation in schools, classrooms and the education, in broader terms.
"How would I know?" (English IX, PTB, p. 34)	This is a counter question by Hazrat Asma R.A. to Abu Jehl, who asks her about her father. Her counter question infuriates him and he, in response slaps her. The text thus promotes the negative value of gender based violence. However, according to author this also shows her courage and valour.
"What are you doing? Fighting a lost battle?" (English IX, PTB, p. 94)	This is not a question but a remark by a senior nurse to Rahila (a nurse). Rahila wants to help a patient, but the doctors are of the view that there are a number of other cases that are more important to attend with more chances of the patient's survival.
"Are you looking for your patient?" (English IX, PTB, p. 95)	This question is by Hira, who is only shown as a patient. Neither the text nor this question shows any specific aspect of women representation.
"How was it possible, to walk for an hour in the woods and see nothing worthy of note?" (English IX, PTB, p. 125)	This question is asked by a female character, who wants to emphasise on the importance of feelings. Her question does not highlight any particular aspect of women representation in the textbook.
"Shall we start?" (English IX, PTB, p. 22)	This is a question by a female teacher in the class. She involves the students in class discussion. Her presence in the text allows the interpretation of female education and carrier opportunities.

#### 4.5.1.3. Imperatives

The imperative is the least used mood of sentences used in the textbooks by the authors.

**Table 4.4: Imperatives**

Imperative	Interpretation and Explanation
"don't worry" (English IX, AJKTB, p. 3)	It is not a command but the consoling remark by Hazrat Khadija R.A. for Hazrat Muhammad SAW when he is distress.
"Look!" (English IX, AJKTB, p. 34)	This is a remark in an informal conversation between a father and a daughter. No significant aspect of women representation is highlighted.
"Now please sit down" (English X, AJKTB, p. 131)	This is a command by a male teacher to a female student. He is being polite in ordering the student to sit down. The presence of the girl in the classroom signifies the access of girls to education.
"I would invite one of you to sum up the	This is said by a female teacher in the class, who tries to involve the students in class lecture. Her presence is

discussion” (English IX, PTB p. 22)	significant in terms of female education and professional rights.
“come grandfather look” (English IX, PTB, p. 34)	It is an invitation by Hazrat Asma R.A for her grandfather. He thinks that his son has taken all the money with him, which Hazrat Asma R.A overcomes by covering some stones and telling her grandfather that this is the money.
“Try once for her” (English IX, PTB, p. 95)	This is a monologue as the speaker tries to support herself to take a chance and work on a patient who does not have the chances of survival. This shows her enthusiasm and delegation for her duty.

#### 4.5.2. Modality

**Table 4.5: Modality**

	Must	Shall	Should	will	Would	May	Might	Can	Could
Class IX AJKTB	0	1	3	0	0	1	0	1	0
Class XAJKTB	2	0	0	1	1	0	0	1	0
Class IX PTB	0	1	9	2	5	0	1	1	8
Class X PTB	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

##### 4.5.2.1 Interpretation and Explanation

“Must” has been used only in The X class textbook of AJKTB and highlights the importance of some of health rules as “we **must** brush our teeth at least twice a day” and “one **must** learn to say “no to offers of drug use”. The text shows that these rules have been stated by two female students, which allows the interpretation of women’s access to education.

The use of “shall” in the IX class textbook of AJKTB shows a woman in the role of the teacher of her child with the words; “I **shall** teach him myself” (English IX, AJKTB, p. 53). In the IX class textbook of PTB the use of “**shall**” and “**should**” do not highlight any aspect of women representation as the story is stated by a blind woman with the desire to see. She gives an account of activities she would do.

The use of “should” in the IX class textbook of AJKTB highlights the necessity of household duties with the carrier responsibilities. The text reads; “He (Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah) wished that women **should** stand shoulder to shoulder with men. They **should** take interest in household work and in social welfare work” (English IX, AJKTB, p. 14). The use of “**should**” also presupposes the access of girls to education with the words; “School boys and school girls **should** pay particular attention to

the section dealing with pedestrians” (English IX, AJKTb, p. 62). The use of “**can**” in AJKTb highlights the importance of women for national progress as, “No nation **can** rise to the height of glory unless your women are side by side with you” (English X, AJKTb, p. 26). The use of **can** in the X class textbook of AJTB shows the rights of women as, “They **can** engage in trade and have their own property” (English X, AJKTb, p. 26).

In the IX class textbook of PTB, it reflects the importance of feelings as the character says, “I **can** best illustrate by imagining” (English IX, PTB, p. 124).

In the X class textbook of AJKTb, the use of “**will**” highlights the importance of women in the role of a mother with the words, “Give me good mothers; I **will** give you a great nation” (English X, AJKTb, p. 26). In the IX class textbook of PTB, it shows some positive attribute of Hazrat Asma R.A. as “Hazrat Asma **will** always be remembered for her courage, generosity and wisdom” (English IX, PTB, p. 35). It also highlights the threat of a doctor to a nurse who is stuck with only one patient as, “If you spend most of your duty hours on one patient, we **will** have to recruit more nurses to attend to other patients” (English IX, PTB, p. 95).

The use of “would” in the IX class textbook of AJKTb shows Hazrat Asma’s R.A. valour, courage and wisdom. She is asked about her father from Abu Jehl and she answers “How **would** I know? ... She didn’t make a statement that **would** give a clue” (English IX, PTB, p. 35).

The use of “**may**” and “might” do not reflect any aspect of women representation in the text.

“**May** Allah shower his blessings on her” (English IX, PTB, p. 35).

“This **might** help her walk like a normal person” (English IX, PTB, p. 94).

The use of “could” in the IX class textbook of PTB shows the efforts of a nurse and the desire of a lady to see. Both instances show the neutral female representation in high frequency content which does not talk about any quality representation in terms of their diversity or attributes.

#### 4.6 Textual structures

These structures are used to analyse the dialogues or monologues in the text. Interruption, enforcing explicitness, formulation and controlling the topic are the component of analysis in this section. Only controlling the

topic has been used in the textbooks of AJKTB and PTB for secondary levels has been used.

#### 4.6.1 Controlling the Topic

This technique shows the power between two participants, who is dominant or speaks more in a conversation. In the IX class textbook of AJKTB, Hazrat Khadija R.A. is the controller of conversation between her and Hazrat Muhammad SAW, in the following extract;

“He told Hazrat Khadija R.A. about the incident of the cave. Hazrat Khadija R.A. consoled him and said, “don’t worry. You always speak the truth you are kind to others. You are honest, hospitable and helpful to others in distress. Allah almighty will not let you alone” (English IX, AJKTB, p. 3).

Hazrat Khadija R.A. is seen in the role of a wife.

Another instance of controlling the topic in the IX class textbook of AJKTB is the Midas’s daughter in the following text, where the traditional depiction is dominant with the words, sob and cry for the girl;

“Look!” she sobbed. “Something dreadful has happened to the roses”...But this is a golden rose. Exclaimed Midas... I don’t care”, cried the child, stamping her foot. “I hate it!” “I hate it!” She threw it from her hand and came to sit on her father’s knee (English IX, AJKTB, p. 34)

The third instance of “controlling the topic” has been seen in the IX class textbook of AJKTB as;

“I am sorry, your boy seems to be backward...This shocked her and she said, “what nonsense! Tom is a very clever boy. I shall teach him myself” (English IX, AJKTB, p. 53).

Mrs. Nancy Edison takes the role of a mother as the teacher and the reading of the text shows that her son became a successful scientist at the end. In the X class textbook of AJKTB, Mrs. Saleem takes the same role as is seen in the following extract;

“Ayesha was eager to know which of the men was justified. The answer is simple my daughter, we should not place our bags or other personal items on seats while even a single passenger is standing. In the same way, putting feet on the seats is also a bad habit, said Mrs. Saleem” (English X, AJKTB, p. 77).



In the IX class textbook of PTB following example shows the technique of controlling the topic;

“Shall we start”? She asks politely. Yes, the students nod...

“Student 1: I would like to add a bit more to it. Teacher: yes sure”!

(English IX, PTB, p. 22)

Miss Ayesha is seen in the role of a teacher allowing the interpretation of the access of girls to carrier opportunities.

The IX class textbook of PTB also highlights the characteristics of bravery and valour of a Hazrat Asma R.A by not answering a man even when she is pressured and the man also slaps her.

“Addressing Hazrat Asma R.A., he demanded “Where is your father?” She politely replied. “How would I know”? (English IX, PTB, p. 34)

## 5. Results and Discussion

This study was conducted on English Language Textbooks of AJKTb and PTB for secondary level based on the differences in representing women in a preliminary reading using three dimensional model of CDA. The emphasis was to find out the standards of “values and attributes” and “diversity and equality” present in each textbook. When analyzed, AJKTb textbooks revealed the presence of values and attributes with the characteristics as piety, nobility, modesty, purity, wealth, determination, strength, courage, the ability to defend their rights and fight for the rights of other women. The role of a helper reflecting generosity and openheartedness, the role of a narrator, “the first woman to accept Islam”, “the first lady”, and “Tahira” (the pure one) are some of the titles and attributes positively representing the women in AJKTb. There is also a list of awards and honours for Begum Ra’ana Liaquat Ali that also contributes to positive women representation in highlighting the values and attributes. The list includes the titles as “Jane Adam,s Medal (1950), Woman of Achievement medal (1950), Mother of Pakistan (1950), Nishan e Imtiaz (1959), Grand Cross of Orange Nassau (the Netherlands, 1961), International Gimbel award for service to humanity (1961 – 1962), Women of the world (chosen by the Turkish women Association, 1965), Vavaliera di Gran Croce” (Italy, 1966). These attributes break the stereotypes in representing the values and attributed for women as previously, the females in the textbooks were seen as coward, soft, polite and silly, while strength, courage, and determination were the characteristics a woman was always deprived of (Hameed, 2012). In AJKTb textbooks with a vast positivity the

one traditional attribute is also highlighted as “little”, which is called the feminine attribute (Jabeen et al., 2014). On the other hand, the analysis of PTB textbooks show the “values and attributes” as favorite, polite, generous, openhearted, steadfast, strong and wise. The first four attributes have been called the stereotypical female characteristics (Hameed, 2012) while the last three are absent in the previous researches (Hameed, 2012). The determined nature of woman as a positive role and the emotional nature of women as stereotypical role are also found out during the analysis. The title of Zaat-un-Nataqin also highlights positivity. The absolute negativity is promoted through the values of a thief and a strict sister in the X class textbook of PTB.

“Diversity and equality” was explored first in terms of names as marker of individual identity. In the IX class textbook of AJKTb 6, in the X class textbook of AJKTb 11, and in the IX class textbook of PTB 4 female characters are named. Women identity in terms of name is denied in PTB Textbook for grade X as there is no named female character in this textbook.

“Diversity and equality” also explored the rights for female characters in the textbooks. The AJKTb textbooks include the rights as; to live, honor, to possess and to control money and assets, to trade, to be a part of national development, to get education, to get into the politics, to join any of the firm or organization, to form these organizations, to work as ambassadors and governors, to work for the betterment of other women, to join a vast range of professions according to their will. On the other hand, PTB textbooks do not mention any right of women explicitly. However, after the close analysis of textual features some rights can be presupposed including, ownership of money by women, inheritance right, the right to have education and career. The rights of women have been completely neglected in the X class textbook of PTB.

“Diversity and equality” also shows the women in different domains. AJKTb includes the professional representation of women in business, politics (national progress) and education, medicine, engineering banking, teaching, writing, poetry, farming, labour, art and welcomes women as ambassadors, diplomats, feminists and social workers which lies in opposition of Durrani’s (2008) findings which define home as the ultimate space for women in the textbooks. Moreover as opposed to the previous researches (Emerson, 2018; Dawar & Anand, 2017; Ullah et al., 2014; Jabeen et al., 2014; Mattu & Hussain, 2013), the female characters

from Muslim and Pakistan history are also shown positively. The PTB textbooks allow only the teaching and nursing professions for women which are also called feminine professions in previous researchers (Agha et al., 2018; Ullah & Skelton, 2013). The X class textbook of PTB negates the presence of women in any professional domain.

The “Diversity and equality” also highlights the traditional domains to show the ratio of positivity. The traditional activity in AJKTB is packing the luggage which includes the father, mother, sister and brother together and is not defined as women’s duty only. However, the traditional roles in PTB textbook is cooking associated with women (Ullah et al., 2014; Jabeen et al., 2014; Jabeen & Ilyas, 2013). Besides traditional activities, the women are also seen in traditional roles, such as in AJKTB Hazrat Khadija R.A. consoles her husband, Mrs. Nancy Edison and Mrs. Saleem are the teachers of their children. No such role is seen in PTB textbooks.

The “Diversity and equality” also points to the negativity promoted in the textbooks. No negativity is seen in AJKTB textbooks. The PTB textbooks however, promoted negative values as gender-based violence, the rigidity and the stealer.

## **6. Conclusion**

This study explored the women representation in English textbooks of AJKTB and PTB for secondary level, based on the standards of values and attributes and diversity and equality marked in NCEL (2006), which aim to incorporate the societal standards and values of an individual in the contents of the textbooks. The results demonstrate that AJKTB textbooks consider women empowerment and allow female space in the textbooks in terms of values and attributes and diversity and equality. The stereotypical ratio is less, and no negative values are promoted. On the other hand, the content of PTB textbooks is not only less in ratio but also represents more traditional and negative values, neglecting their rights or space. This study stipulates the revision of the textbooks with the inclusion of the values marked in NCEL so that the textbooks may truly represent the standards of NCEL (2006).

## **7. Recommendations and Suggestions**

- The textbook of class X of PTB does not include any right of women. The revision of the textbooks with the inclusion of female rights is highly recommended.

- NCRC can perform its role by actively reviewing the textbooks of both textbook boards.
- The other researchers may also expand sample size.

### References

- Abbas, T., Abrar, M., Saleem, R., & Iqbal, A. (2016). What Leads to Success for Women Entrepreneurs? An Empirical Study of Southern Punjab in Pakistan. *Academic Research International*, 7(5), 120-130. Retrieved from [http://www.savap.org.pk/journals/ARInt./Vol.7\(5\)/2016\(7.5-12\).pdf](http://www.savap.org.pk/journals/ARInt./Vol.7(5)/2016(7.5-12).pdf)
- Agha, N., Syed, G. K., & Mirani, D. L. (2018). Exploring the Representation of Gender and Identity: Patriarchal and Citizenship Perspectives from the Primary Level Sindhi Textbooks in Pakistan. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 66(2018), 17-24. Retrieved from <http://isiarticles.com/bundles/Article/pre/pdf/130174.pdf>
- Akincioglu, M. (2012). Critical Approach to Textbook Analysis: Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) of two EAP Textbooks (MLitt ELT thesis at University of St. Andrews). Retrieved from [https://www.academia.edu/2582300/Mustafa\\_Akincioglu\\_-\\_A\\_Critical\\_Approach\\_to\\_Textbook\\_Analysis\\_Critical\\_Discourse\\_Analysis\\_CDA\\_of\\_two\\_EAP\\_Textbooks](https://www.academia.edu/2582300/Mustafa_Akincioglu_-_A_Critical_Approach_to_Textbook_Analysis_Critical_Discourse_Analysis_CDA_of_two_EAP_Textbooks)
- Aoumeur, H. (2014). Gender Representations in Three School Textbooks: A Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis. *International Journal of Research in Humanities, Arts and Literature*, 2(9), 13-21. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download;jsessionid=4F30CE88C7A86CB7B0589EAF51ECB7D2?doi=10.1.1.685.9556&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Bhattacharya, S. (2014). Status of Women in Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan J.R.S.P.*, 51(1), 179-211. Retrieved from [http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/history/PDF-FILES/7v51\\_No1\\_14.pdf](http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/history/PDF-FILES/7v51_No1_14.pdf)
- Blumberg, R. L. (2009). The Invisible obstacle to educational equality: gender bias in textbooks. *Prospects*, 38(3), 345-361. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/225554582\\_The\\_invisible\\_obstacle\\_to\\_educational\\_equality\\_Gender\\_bias\\_in\\_textbooks](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/225554582_The_invisible_obstacle_to_educational_equality_Gender_bias_in_textbooks)
- Blumberg, R. L. (2015). Eliminating Gender Bias in Textbooks: Pushing for Policy Reforms that Promote Gender Equity in education. *Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2015 Education for All*

2000-2015: *achievements and challenges*. Retrieved from [https://www.rosadoc.be/digidocs/dd000659\\_2015\\_Eliminating\\_gender\\_bias\\_in\\_textbooks\\_policy\\_reform.pdf](https://www.rosadoc.be/digidocs/dd000659_2015_Eliminating_gender_bias_in_textbooks_policy_reform.pdf)

- Chaudhary, I. S., Nosheen, F., & Lodi, M. I. (2012). Women Empowerment in Pakistan with Special Reference to Islamic Viewpoint: An Empirical Study. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)*, 32(1), 171-183. Retrieved from [https://www.bzu.edu.pk/PJSS/Vol32No12012/Final\\_PJSS-32-1-13.pdf](https://www.bzu.edu.pk/PJSS/Vol32No12012/Final_PJSS-32-1-13.pdf)
- Durrani, N. (2008). Schooling the 'other': The Representation of Gender and National Identities in Pakistani Curriculum Texts. *Compare*, 38(5), 595-610. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03057920802351374>
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and Power*. Harlow, England: Addison Wesley Longman Limited.
- Fairclough, N. (2003). *Analysing discourse: Textual analysis for social research*. London: Routledge
- Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations Economic and Social Perspectives. (2010, March). *Gender and Land Rights Understanding Complexities; Adjusting Policies*. Retrieved from <http://www.fao.org/3/al059e/al059e00.pdf>
- Hameed, A. (2012). *A Gender-based Study of English Textbooks Produced by Punjab Textbook Board and Oxford University Press for Elementary Level* (PhD thesis). National University of Modern Languages) Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Hamid, M., & Iqbal, S. (2013). Gender Discrimination in the Curriculum of Urdu (Compulsory) at Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: An Analysis. *International Journal of Business and Social Research (IJBSR)*, 3(7), 70-77. Retrieved from <https://thejournalofbusiness.org/index.php/site/article/viewFile/261/257>
- Hussain, M. N., & Asfar, A. (2009). Language and Gender - Linguistic Analysis of Intermediate English Textbooks in Pakistan. *Language in India. Strength for Today and Bright Hope for Tomorrow*, 10(11), 26-42. Retrieved from [https://www.academia.edu/622715/Language\\_and\\_Gender\\_Linguistic\\_Analysis\\_of\\_Intermediate\\_English\\_Textbooks\\_in\\_Pakistan](https://www.academia.edu/622715/Language_and_Gender_Linguistic_Analysis_of_Intermediate_English_Textbooks_in_Pakistan)

- Hussain, Naseer, M., & Asfar, A. (2010). Language and Gender – Linguistic Analysis of Intermediate English Textbooks in Pakistan. *Language in India* 10(November) 26-42. Retrieved from [https://www.academia.edu/622715/Language\\_and\\_Gender\\_Linguistic\\_Analysis\\_of\\_Intermediate\\_English\\_Textbooks\\_in\\_Pakistan](https://www.academia.edu/622715/Language_and_Gender_Linguistic_Analysis_of_Intermediate_English_Textbooks_in_Pakistan)
- Hyder, W. (2018). Pakistan at Bottom in Gender Equality at Work Index. *Pakistan Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/04/25/pakistan-at-bottom-in-gender-equality-at-work-index/>
- Islam, K. M. M., & Asadullah, M. N. (2016). Gender Stereotypes and Education: A Multi-Country Content Analysis Study of Secondary School Textbooks. *Thinking Gender Papers*, 2016. Retrieved from <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/38r9r094>
- Islam, K. M. M., & Asadullah, M. N. (2018). Gender stereotypes and education: A comparative content analysis of Malaysian, Indonesian, Pakistani and Bangladeshi School Textbooks. *PLOS ONE*, 13(1). Retrieved from <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5774688/>
- Jabeen, S., & Ilyas, A. (2012). Gender Role Modeling in Textbooks: Case Study of Urdu Textbooks of Sindh Province. *Pakistan Journal of Women's Studies: Alam-e-Niswan*, 19(1), 75-93. Retrieved from [https://www.academia.edu/5799618/GENDER\\_ROLE\\_MODELING\\_IN\\_TEXTBOOKS\\_CASE\\_STUDY\\_OF\\_URDU\\_TEXTBOOKS\\_OF\\_SINDH\\_PROVINCE](https://www.academia.edu/5799618/GENDER_ROLE_MODELING_IN_TEXTBOOKS_CASE_STUDY_OF_URDU_TEXTBOOKS_OF_SINDH_PROVINCE)
- Jabeen, S., Chaudhary, A. Q., & Omar, S. (2014). Gender Discrimination in Curriculum: A Reflection from Punjab Textbook Board. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 36(1), 55-77. Retrieved from [http://www.pu.edu.pk/images/journal/ier/PDFFILES/4\\_Jabeen,%20Qayyum%20&%20Omar\\_V36-no1-2014.pdf](http://www.pu.edu.pk/images/journal/ier/PDFFILES/4_Jabeen,%20Qayyum%20&%20Omar_V36-no1-2014.pdf)
- Khurshid, K., Gillani, I. G., & Hashmi, M, A. (2010). A Study of the Representation of Female Image in the Textbooks of English and Urdu at Secondary School Level. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)*, 30(2), 425-437. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265973944\\_A\\_Study\\_of\\_the\\_Representation\\_of\\_Female\\_Image\\_in\\_the\\_Textbooks\\_of\\_English\\_and\\_Urdu\\_at\\_Secondary\\_School\\_Level](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265973944_A_Study_of_the_Representation_of_Female_Image_in_the_Textbooks_of_English_and_Urdu_at_Secondary_School_Level)
- Lund, A. A. (2019, January 14). Gender discrimination in Pakistan. *Daily Times*. Retrieved from <https://dailytimes.com.pk/343842/gender-discrimination-in-pakistan-3/>
- Mahmood, M. (2010). Textbook Evaluation in Pakistan: Issue of Conformity to the National Curriculum Guidelines. *Bulletin of*

- Education and Research, 32(1), 15-36. Retrieved from [http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/pesr/PDF-FILES/2-Textbook\\_Evaluation-Amended\\_14-7-2010.pdf](http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/pesr/PDF-FILES/2-Textbook_Evaluation-Amended_14-7-2010.pdf)
- Masud, H. (2017, September 28). Curriculum, Textbooks and Gender Stereotypes: The case of Pakistan. *Worlds of Education*. Retrieved from [https://worldsofeducation.org/en/woe\\_homepage/woe\\_detail/15405/curriculum-textbooks-and-gender-stereotypes-the-case-of-pakistan](https://worldsofeducation.org/en/woe_homepage/woe_detail/15405/curriculum-textbooks-and-gender-stereotypes-the-case-of-pakistan)
- Mattu, A., & Hussain, N. (2003). Gender Biases and Stereotypes in School Texts. Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad (91-98). Retrieved from <https://www.hurights.or.jp/pub/hreas/7/11GenderBias.pdf>
- Mirza, M. (2004). Gender Analysis of School Curriculum and Text Books. *UNESCO*. Retrieved from <http://unesco.org.pk/education/documents/publications/Gender%20Analysis%20of%20School%20Curriculum%20and%20Text%20Books.pdf> [Accessed 4 Jan. 2018].
- Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan (2006). *National curriculum Framework of Pakistan*. Retrieved from [http://bisep.com.pk/downloads/curriculum/Grades-I-XII/pk\\_al\\_eng\\_2006\\_eng.pdf](http://bisep.com.pk/downloads/curriculum/Grades-I-XII/pk_al_eng_2006_eng.pdf)
- National Assembly of Pakistan (1973). *The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan*. Retrieved from [http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1333523681\\_951.pdf](http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1333523681_951.pdf)
- Pakistan ranked fourth worst country for women: Report (2017, November 29). *Pakistan Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2017/11/29/pakistan-ranked-fourth-worst-country-for-women-report/>
- Rafiq, T., & Kanwal, I. (2016). Representation of Females in Grammar Books – A Critical Discourse Analysis of Wren & Martin's High School English Grammar. *Pakistan Journal of Contemporary Sciences*, 1(1), 93-108. Retrieved from <http://pjcs.com.pk/adminSide/uploadPapers/72a32.pdf>
- Razmjoo, S. A., & Jozaghi, Z. (2010). The Representation of multiple intelligences types in the Top-Notch series: A textbook evaluation. *Journal of Pan-Pacific Association of Applied Linguistics*, 14(2), 59-84. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ920521.pdf>
- Sadkar, Zittleman, k., Early, P., McCormick, K., Strawn, C., & Preston, J. (2007). The Treatment of Gender Equity in Teacher Education. In

- Susan S. Klein et al (Eds.). *Handbook for achieving gender equity through education*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Shah, S. F. (2012). An Investigation into the Alignment between the Government's Dictated English Language Curriculum and the Textbook Mediated Classroom Practices at the Secondary Level in Pakistan (Master's thesis, Nottingham Trent University). Retrieved from [http://irep.ntu.ac.uk/id/eprint/292/1/211220\\_Saira.Shah-2012.pdf](http://irep.ntu.ac.uk/id/eprint/292/1/211220_Saira.Shah-2012.pdf)
- Shah, S. W. A., & Pathan, H. (2016). Representation of Western Culture in O' level English Language Textbooks. *ELF Annual Research Journal*, 18(2016), 23-42. Retrieved from <http://elf.salu.edu.pk/sites/default/files/journals/ELF-Vol-18-2016/02Paper.pdf>
- Shahrokhi, M. (2015). A Critical Discourse Analysis of ELT Materials in Gender Representation: A Comparison of Summit and Top Notch. *English Language Teaching* 8(1), 121-133. Retrieved from <http://www.ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/elt/article/view/43433>
- Ullah, H., & Skelton, C. (2013). Gender Representation in the Public Sector Schools Textbooks of Pakistan." *Educational Studies* 39(2), 183-194. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03055698.2012.702892?src=recsys&journalCode=ceds20>
- Ullah, H., Ali, J., & Naz, A. (2014). Gender Representation in Children's Books: A Critical Review of Empirical Studies. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 29(1):134-141. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/289484251\\_Gender\\_representation\\_in\\_children's\\_books\\_A\\_critical\\_review\\_of\\_empirical\\_studies](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/289484251_Gender_representation_in_children's_books_A_critical_review_of_empirical_studies)
- Ullah, H., & Haque, H. (2016). The Representation of Boys' and Girls' Activities in School Textbooks. *FWU Journal of Social Sciences*, 1(1), 81-87. Retrieved from <http://www.sbbwu.edu.pk/journal/Summmer%202016%20Vol.10.No.1/10%20The%20representation%20of%20boys%20and%20girls%20activities.pdf>
- Ullah, H., Abdullah, F., Ahmad, A., & Ali, R. (2018). GENDER REPRESENTATION IN MATHEMATICS TEXTBOOKS IN AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR. *International Journal of Innovation in Teaching and Learning (IJITL)*, 3(2), 1-17. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/328828295\\_GENDER\\_REPRESENTATION\\_IN\\_MATHEMATICS\\_TEXTBOOKS\\_IN\\_A](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/328828295_GENDER_REPRESENTATION_IN_MATHEMATICS_TEXTBOOKS_IN_A)



ZAD\_JAMMU\_KASHMIR/link/5be534c04585150b2ba9066c/download

- Van Dijk, T. A. (1991). *Racism and the Press*. London: Routledge
- Van Dijk, T. (1993a). Principles of Critical Discourse Analysis. *Discourse and Society*, 4(2), 249- 283. Retrieved from [https://www.jstor.org/stable/42888777?Search=yes&resultItemClick=true&searchText=Principles&searchText=of&searchText=Critical&searchText=Discourse&searchText=Analysis.&searchUri=%2Faction%2FdoBasicSearch%3FQuery%3DPrinciples%2Bof%2BCritical%2BDiscourse%2BAnalysis.%26amp%3Bfilter%3D&ab\\_segments=0%2Ftsub-1%2Frelevance\\_config\\_with\\_tsub&refreqid=search%3A85f1bb84fdf11204e58845b1b1b8498b&seq=1#page\\_scan\\_tab\\_contents](https://www.jstor.org/stable/42888777?Search=yes&resultItemClick=true&searchText=Principles&searchText=of&searchText=Critical&searchText=Discourse&searchText=Analysis.&searchUri=%2Faction%2FdoBasicSearch%3FQuery%3DPrinciples%2Bof%2BCritical%2BDiscourse%2BAnalysis.%26amp%3Bfilter%3D&ab_segments=0%2Ftsub-1%2Frelevance_config_with_tsub&refreqid=search%3A85f1bb84fdf11204e58845b1b1b8498b&seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents)
- Wodak, R. (2002). Aspects of Critical Discourse Analysis. *Zeitschrift für Angewandte Linguistik ZfAL* 36(2002), 5-31. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.121.1792&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Wattoo, A. M. (2014, November 11). Inheritance rights of women. *Pakistan Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2014/11/11/inheritance-rights-of-women/>
- World Bank Says Pakistan Ranks Lowest Among Countries With Women Entrepreneurs (2017, November, 2011). *The International News*.
- World Economic Forum. (2016). *The Global Gender Gap Report*. Retrieved from [http://www3.weforum.org/docs/GGGR16/WEF\\_Global\\_Gender\\_Gap\\_Report\\_2016](http://www3.weforum.org/docs/GGGR16/WEF_Global_Gender_Gap_Report_2016)
- Yaqoob, M. T. (2011). Ideology and Worldview in Textbooks: A Study of Cultural Aspects in ELT in Pakistan (Phd Thesis, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan). Retrieved from <http://pr.hec.gov.pk/jspui/bitstream/123456789/1523/1/1233S.pdf>